# **Chapter 16: Understanding Social and Political Philosophy**

# **Background**

Chapter 16 revolves around the political spectrum, which some students may recall from their Grade 10 Civics course or other Social Studies courses. Locating the political parties of Canada along the spectrum can be a helpful way of drawing students into this conversation, showing differences in terms of who makes decisions (the government or entrepreneurs) or how much autonomy citizens should have with respect to securing benefits (the "nanny state" versus the libertarian ideal of freedom from authority). The discussion here forms a basis for understanding different perspectives on distributive justice, taken up in Chapter 17.

# **About Chapter 16**

The topic of social and political philosophy is introduced, starting with a survey of thinkers who addressed the concept of the ideal state (which is the topic of students' culminating activity).

#### **Features**

In this chapter, the following features are included to help students make personal connections and/or deepen their understanding of social and political philosophy. You may use all or some of these features as explained below.

Feature	Student Textbook Page(s)	Opportunity for Assessment	Strategies for Classroom Use
Your Unit Challenge	387	Ask students to post their questions on a wall or "Moodle." (See moodle.org for more information.) Encourage students to hold a discussion, effectively creating a community of interest around the questions they generated. Use this for assessment as or for learning.	Ask students to consider the actions of the monk in Figure 16-1, SE p. 386. Is an act like this warranted in certain circumstances to effect political change, or did this person waste his life through this act of self-sacrifice?
Thought Experiment	402-403	Use questions 1 and 2 on SE p. 403 to encourage students to generate a journal response (use BLM J) or short speech (live or video/audio recorded).	Create an application of Rawls' principle, as in picking teams for a debate: you'll be more fair in your distribution of key players if you don't know who gets which team before the draw. (Also see Teaching Plan 2, Teaching Strategy 2 for a similar activity.)
Viewpoints	406	Use questions 1 and 2 on SE p. 407 as starting points for a debate on the topic: When is violence justified?	See also Malcolm X and the belief that violence is justified to right wrongs in society. (See Teaching Plan 2, Teaching Strategy 3 for a link to a speech given by Malcolm X.)

# BIG

- Plato started a line of inquiry into what constitutes the ideal state, taken up and revised by successive thinkers in the Christian and Islamic tradition, as well as More and Machiavelli. (SE pp. 390-392)
- Social contract theory offers several perspectives on human nature and why we benefit from association in commonwealths or states, including thinkers like Locke, Rousseau, and Hobbes. (SE pp. 393-394)
- In weighing the degree of freedom and authority needed to achieve happiness and successfully govern people, thinkers are divided along a spectrum from liberal (on the left) to conservative (on the right). More extreme forms are found on the far left, such as Marxism and anarchism; the extreme right is occupied by fascism. (SE pp. 394-396)
- Depending on one's location on the political spectrum, one will hold different views on when or whether it is ever called for to challenge state authority. One's position on the spectrum also affects one's view of the basic rights and responsibilities of citizens, and whether social classes are natural divisions based on effort or inequitable and exploitative arrangements entrenched in society. (SE pp. 396-410)

#### **Learning Goal**

Students will come to understand the different philosophical positions on the political spectrum, ranging from conservatism to liberalism, and also be able to locate Marxism, fascism, and anarchism on the extremes of this scale between individual autonomy and government control of the economy and affairs of the people.

# **Teaching Plan 1** (SE pp. 386-398)

# **Activity Description**

One of the main themes of this chapter is revolution. Students are asked to consider when citizens are justified in taking up protest or rebellion against the state. To make this more pertinent to their lives, students are exposed to the concept of social drama (BLM 16.2) and apply this theory to a hypothetical situation.

# **Assessment Opportunities for Chapter Questions**

The table below summarizes assessment opportunities for selected chapter questions, which are relevant to this teaching plan.

Assessment Type	Assessment Tool	Section Questions
Assessment for/as Learning	Review; opinion formation	1-2, SE p. 392
Assessment for Learning	Summary; application of theories	1-4, SE p. 398

## **Timing**

225 minutes (three 75-minute classes)

#### **Learning Skills Focus**

- Responsibility
- Collaboration
- Independent work
- Organization
- · Self-regulation
- Initiative

### **Resources Needed**

Make copies of these Blackline Masters:

- BLM 16.1 Unit 6 Culminating Activity: Utopia Project (Assessment of Learning)
- BLM 16.2 Social-Drama Theory and Political Change

# **Possible Assessment of Learning Task**

Students may be inspired to write a journal response to the Tiananmen Square crisis, or another case of social drama, reflecting on Turner's theory of social drama described on BLM 16.2.

## Assessment (For/As Learning)

As teachers move through each chapter, opportunities will be highlighted to provide assessment for/as learning in preparation for assessment of learning at the end of each chapter.

Task/Project	Achievement Chart Category	Type of Assessment	Assessment Tool	Peer/Self/ Teacher Assessment	Learning Skill	Student Textbook Page(s)	Blackline Master
Tracking influences	Knowledge	For	Self-directed study	Self	Independent work	390- 392	BLM C
Charting pri- mary docu- ments	Knowledge; Thinking	For	Using mind maps to track main ideas and shifts in rea- soning	Teacher	Independent work	390- 395	BLM C
Applying social-drama theory to examples of social movements	Thinking; Application	As	Using Turner's model to exam- ine revolution- ary moments	Self; teacher	Collaboration	396- 398	BLM 16.2
Simulation	Application; Communication	As	Role play	Peer	Collaboration; initiative	396- 398	

# **Prior Learning Needed**

This unit draws on previous discussions of the canonical philosophers, such as Plato and Aristotle, Locke and Hume, etc.

# **Teaching/Learning Strategies**

1. The startling image in the Unit Opener (SE p. 386) of a monk self-immolating in protest over the Vietnam War may seem remote for students. But similar protests are happening again now, with Buddhist monks protesting the Chinese presence in (or, as many people would claim, occupation of) Tibet. A sharp contrast is shown with the image of people standing on a police car during the G-20 summit in Toronto (Figure 16-2, SE p. 388), as this image does not suggest the self-sacrifice of the protesting monk, but vandalism. It was a small minority of people who participated in the violent protest in Toronto: the self-proclaimed "black bloc" anarchists who came prepared to damage property to make their point.

While examining the Unit Opener with your class, perhaps an opening question to students could be: How do we know what measures are called for, when gauging the appropriateness of political demonstrations? What is it about globalization that draws such an emotional response? Connect this to Fanon and the response to neocolonialism on SE pp. 404-406. For additional ideas about globalization, look up this link:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NhPf8hcuFYoandfeature=related

The student textbook distinguishes between social and political philosophy on SE p. 389. Perhaps another way to distinguish between social and political philosophy is to suggest that the economic changes brought about by globalization might be approached sociologically, through social philosophy, whereas political philosophy goes more into the ideologies and deeper philosophical treatises that give foundation to various political parties, movements, or causes. For background, check out this link on political philosophy:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xhm55mIdSukandfeature=related

2. The student textbook section on the ideal state opens the chapter and sets the stage for the Utopia Project culminating activity. This might be the best time to hand out BLM 16.1. Opening with Plato and Aristotle, as well as their influence on Islamic and Medieval thinkers (SE pp. 390-392), students are gaining background on the concept of the *philosopher-king* and weighing the advantages and disadvantages of various forms of government: aristocracy, monarchy, and democracy. One way to open this topic to inspection is to look at the trial of Socrates, and his affiliation with the ruling oligarchs during the turbulent emergence of democracy. These two books may be helpful in this undertaking:

Why Socrates Died: Dispelling the Myths, by Robin Waterfield The Trial of Socrates, by I.F. Stone

For additional background, look up these video titles on YouTube:

- Philosophers and Kings: Plato's Republic, I-II
- 5. Philosophers and Kings: Plato's Republic, III-IV
- 6. Philosophers and Kings: Plato's Republic, V
- 9. The Mixed Regime and the Rule of Law: Aristotle's Politics, VII

The History of Political Philosophy, Lecture 1: Plato (Part 1/2) | Dr. David Gordon

The History of Political Philosophy, Lecture 1: Plato (Part 2/2) | Dr. David Gordon

The History of Political Philosophy, Lecture 2: Aristotle (Part 1/2) | Dr. David Gordon

For encyclopaedic information and primary texts of Islamic scholars, look up these Web links:

http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ip/rep/H021.htm

http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/ir/art/ibn%20rushd-rep.htm

http://www.muslimphilosophy.com/sina/

For primary documents on Thomas Aquinas' *On Princely Government*, see the following books (both of which can be previewed at Google Books):

A Textbook of Christian Ethics, by Robin Gill

Western Philosophy: An Anthology, by John Cottingham

In addition, see Timothy Renick's paper "Aquinas":

 $http://www.blackwellpublishing.com/content/BPL\_Images/Content\_store/Sample\_chapter/9780631231455/Arrington.pdf$ 

Also, follow this link to watch a video on the history of political philosophy, focusing on Aquinas:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o4UCWQBTUzE

As the student textbook moves into Renaissance thinkers, such as Machiavelli and More, the dangers faced by Socrates in his time again surface: Machiavelli was arrested and tortured for his allegiances; More was beheaded for his refusal to recognize Henry VIII as the rightful head of the Church, a position More reserved for the Pope in Rome. More is buried in the chapel inside the Tower of London, along with Anne Boleyn (one of Henry's wives). Ask students to conduct a mock trial as a creative way of getting at the heretical but visionary ideas that emerged in More's time. If your class conducts a mock trial, ensure that students' attention is not diverted to the macabre events that took place instead of the ideas that were at issue. For additional background, look up these video titles on YouTube:

- 10. New Modes and Orders: Machiavelli's The Prince (chaps. 1-12)
- 11. New Modes and Orders: Machiavelli's The Prince (chaps. 13-26)

For a dramatic proclamation of divine law over human law, look up this video title on YouTube:

The Tudors - Trial of Thomas More

This unit's culminating activity calls for serious reflection on Thomas More's *Utopia*, as well as other visionary models of the ideal state. For example, More suggests punishing prisoners by docking their ears for identification, but otherwise sentencing them to relatively benign forms of punishment for the times (sixteenth century): carrying the luggage of tourists, limited mobility within their region of the island, and forcible wearing of gold to weigh them down (a satirical comment on the monarchs of More's time and their obsession with gold jewellery).

Look up the following links for primary documents of More and Machiavelli:

http://oregonstate.edu/instruct/phl302/texts/more/utopia-contents.html

http://www.constitution.org/mac/prince00.htm

Students may be inspired to create their own film for YouTube explaining More's *Utopia* or their own ideas for a utopia (the culminating activity). For an example of a student presentation, look up the following video title on YouTube:

The Philosophy of Thomas More

Acc If students are reluctant to read primary documents, try starting them on SparkNotes (see the link that follows for material on More's *Utopia*). After some interest in the ideas is built, introduce students to sections of primary documents. The archaic language in More's work may be an obstacle for some students, as it often is when first reading Shakespeare.

http://www.sparknotes.com/philosophy/utopia

**3.** Social contract theory: Discuss the process students and teachers undergo when establishing classroom rules to set up an authentic context for introducing the concept of a social contract. The European settlement of the Americas worked as a case study of social contract theory for thinkers such as Locke and Malthus, as it was an experiment unfolding before them. For additional background on social contract theory (Hobbes, Locke, and Rousseau), look up these links:

http://oregonstate.edu/instruct/phl302/texts/hobbes/leviathan-contents.html http://oregonstate.edu/instruct/phl302/texts/locke/locke2/2nd-contents.html http://www.sparknotes.com/philosophy/locke http://www.constitution.org/jjr/socon.htm

Activity: Choose excerpts from the primary documents found at the Web links listed above for students to read. Follow up by asking students to chart the main ideas and shifts in philosophical reasoning (using thought bubbles or text boxes connected by lines). This activity is similar to the one that students were introduced to in the opening of the student textbook with Bertrand Russell's essay "Why Study Philosophy?" (SE p. 7). You may also consider asking students to use comparison charts for this activity, such as the one that is found on BLM C.

For a modern take on social contract theory, look up this video title on YouTube: Bertrand Russell - Social Cohesion & Human Nature (Part 1)

**4.** Conservatism and liberalism (SE pp. 394-395): Burke and Mill are briefly contrasted in this section to set up the distinction between the two main positions occupied by the majority of political thinkers and parties in Western philosophy. It is against these two major schools of thought that Karl Marx introduces an alternative in the form of *The Communist Manifesto* (see Teaching Plan 2, Teaching Strategy 1 for more on communism).

Burke's Reflections on the Revolution in France is available online at this link:

http://18th.eserver.org/burke.txt

J.S. Mill's *On Liberty* is available online at this link:

http://socserv.mcmaster.ca/~econ/ugcm/3ll3/mill/liberty.pdf

Acc Draw on students' discussions of major political parties from Grade 10 Civics, and explain why Canada has both a Conservative and Liberal party (large case, as opposed to small case conservative or liberal). In what ways are members of the Conservative Party small 'l' liberal? In what ways are members of the Liberal Party small 'c' conservative?

**5.** Extremes of state authority and challenging state authority (SE pp. 395-398): The best way to introduce these sections is to transport students on a tour of a dystopian state. Look up the links that follow for videos on North Korea. The first 20 minutes of the first documentary listed is eye opening!

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FJ6E3cShcVU http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QSrcLC6Zz54andfeature=related After watching these videos, have a class discussion about the state propaganda used to induce North Koreans to revere the supreme leader (see socialist realism in Unit 7, SE pp. 497-498). Then, ask the class what they think it would take to bring about social change in such a closed, isolationist, or hermetic society such as North Korea. One way to frame this section is through these questions: Is social reform possible in a society such as North Korea? When is violent struggle warranted to bring about social change? To follow up on these questions, visit this link:

http://armsandinfluence.typepad.com/armsandinfluence/revolutionary\_warfare/page/2/

Activity: Here, we move into the exciting topic of social drama. Hand out and go through BLM 16.2 with students to help them understand Victor Turner's theory of social drama. BLM 16.2 suggests a variety of activities that provide opportunity for students to engage the concepts within this theory.

Look up the following video title on YouTube (it is part 1 of 8). The first half-hour of this documentary closely follows the stages of Turner's social-drama theory, with astonishing coverage of the events at Tiananmen Square in China:

The Tank Man 1/8

For further background reading, see Richard Schechner's *The Future of Ritual:* Writings on Culture and Performance.

Acc BLM 16.2 asks students to apply Turner's social-drama theory to events at school, where dress codes and school rules are breached daily. This application may help to make the concepts and process in Turner's theory more concrete for students.

Students might illustrate Turner's theory by performing a skit based on applications to school or community life.

To go deeper into the issue of the modern police state, see Naomi Klein's article "China's All-Seeing Eye," published in *Rolling Stone* magazine:

http://www.naomiklein.org/articles/2008/05/chinas-all-seeing-eye

The problems associated with the electronic surveillance of citizens (see also Chapter 18, SE p. 450) is discussed in part 7 of the "Tank Man" documentary, available through this link:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YLWik2URcjIandfeature=related

For an example of a contemporary philosopher using performance art to dramatize social problems—our materialistic consumer society and its massive garbage disposal problem—look up the following video about the radical Slovenian philosopher Slavoj Žižek:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iGCfiv1xtoUandfeature=related

- DI See the resource book *Cultural Conflicts: Case Studies in a World of Change*, by Edward Lerner. Of several simulations included in this book, the following are most suited to the issues in this unit:
- China, "Economic Freedom Without Civil Liberties"
- Central America/El Salvador, "Reform or Revolution?"
- India, "Maintaining the Caste System"
- North Africa and the Middle East, "Women's Roles in a Traditional Society"

#### **Text Answers**

#### Page 392: Section questions

**1.** a) Plato was ahead of his time (though following in Pythagoras' steps) by including women in his education system (trained as guardians). However, as Jane Roland

Martin notes, the arrogance of his time shows in his jokes among the old men about women also engaging in "gymnastics"—in Greek, this meant "naked wrestling."

Aristotle reveals one of his values at the opening of his *Politics*, where he explains that slaves are fit to be ruled as they are slavish by nature—otherwise they would free themselves. As the tutor to Alexander the Great, Aristotle had 200 slaves.

- b) Saudi Arabia is one example of a state that, to this day, does not grant women the right to vote (this may change in 2015), hold elected office, or drive a car.
- 2. The belief that the church should be held higher than the state may be based on the ancient division between divine and human law, or the City of God versus the City of Man (Augustine). It also draws on the notion that a higher authority has access to ultimate truth (SE p. 99). The United States is an example of a state whose constitution separates church and state (though the line is sometimes blurred by some politicians who hold elected office); Iran, on the other hand, is a theocracy, where the ruling scholars direct the President.

## Page 398: Section questions

- a) Students identify whose philosophy they agree with and explain the reasoning for their choice.
  - b) Hobbes argued that humans are basically selfish and brutal, thus requiring a giant and powerful state to rein them in and prevent harm. Rousseau argued the opposite, that we are innocent in the state of nature. Hobbes was too pessimistic for Locke, who believed humans are innately good (created in God's image), but still requiring the state to protect their property against thieves. Rousseau was perhaps too romantic, idealizing the life of Robinson Crusoe—the model for Rousseau's imaginary pupil, Emile, to follow in his education through first-hand exposure to nature.

It is perhaps worth noting that Rousseau, for whom people are born free but "everywhere in chains," was valorized as an inspiration for the French Revolution—something one would not associate with Hobbes, whom we connect with Leviathan (the monster).

- 2. Conservatism is oriented to maintaining tradition, acting as a brake on social change and preserving the status quo (including disparities in the distribution of goods); liberalism is oriented toward ensuring that basic freedoms and rights are respected, and goods distributed equitably, even when this may lead to social change. The actions of the Chinese government under Deng Xiaoping were conservative—a gerontocracy acting to hold onto its power base against the youth protest and widening social unrest. Liberals would ask why the Chinese government didn't choose that moment to enact incremental reforms in their system, such as multi-party democracy instead of single-party democracy (where you vote for Communist A or B).
- **3.** In the sense that the police were following the orders of the federal Conservative government to "preserve the peace" and ensure the visiting G-20 leaders could continue their assembly, the actions of the state and its police forces were small 'c' conservative. Conservation is the root word, and they saw themselves (rightly or wrongly) as conserving order over the liberal rights of peaceful assembly.
- **4.** What is suggested in this question is sometimes called the "benevolent dictator." For a benevolent dictator to maintain the peace can still be a tyranny. In fact, the word *tyranny* originally applied to Greek leaders who kept the men (i.e., citizens) at home, denying them the right of political assembly (in the *polis*). Can one be happy and not free? That is what was offered to China's growing middle class after Tiananmen Square: economic prosperity and social mobility, not civil liberty, such as freedom of speech or assembly.

#### **Learning Goal**

Students will better understand the rights and responsibilities of citizens, as well as the principle of equality among citizens, drawing on various philosophical positions along the political spectrum.

# **Teaching Plan 2** (SE pp. 399-413)

# **Activity Description**

Students begin this section of the chapter with an exploration of Marxism and Rawls' liberal philosophy, where students consider how to distribute goods equitably. Students move next into consideration of equal rights, opposition to obstacles like racism, neocolonialism, and sexism. Students finish the chapter by exploring reflections on the responsibilities of citizens. A four-corners debate (based on Michael Sandel's lecture on Rawls) could be the high point of this section. It may generate discussion useful to students' work on the culminating activity.

# **Assessment Opportunities for Chapter Questions**

The table below summarizes assessment opportunities for selected chapter questions, including questions in the Chapter Review, which are relevant to this teaching plan.

Assessment Type	Assessment Tool	Feature Questions	Section Questions	Chapter Review Questions
Assessment for Learning	Self-reflection and application	1-2, SE p. 403		
Assessment for Learning	Further inquiry	1-2, SE p. 407		
Assessment for Learning	Reflection and small group discussion		1-4, SE p. 408	
Assessment as Learning	Self-reflection		1-4, SE p. 411	
Assessment for Learning	Organizer and/or comparison charts			1-3, SE p. 412
Assessment as Learning	Extension activities			4-11, SE pp. 412-413

#### **Timing**

225 minutes (three 75-minute periods)

## **Learning Skills Focus**

- Responsibility
- Collaboration
- Independent work
- Organization
- Self-regulation
- Initiative

#### **Resources Needed**

Make copies of this Blackline Master:

• BLM 16.3 Chapter 16 Vocabulary Quiz: Matching (Assessment of Learning)

#### Possible Assessment of Learning Task

Consider using BLM 16.3 Chapter 16 Vocabulary Quiz: Matching (vocabulary terms from SE p. 388). Also consider using questions 1 and 2 on SE p. 407 or section question 4 on SE p. 408 as the basis for students to develop journal responses (see BLM J).

# Assessment (For/As Learning)

As teachers move through each chapter, opportunities will be highlighted to provide assessment for/as learning in preparation for assessment of learning at the end of each chapter. (See table on next page.)

Task/ Project	Achievement Chart Category	Type of Assessment	Assessment Tool	Peer/Self/ Teacher Assessment	Learning Skill	Student Textbook Page(s)
Historical material- ism	Knowledge; Application; Communication	As	Further research and illustration of concept	Self; teacher	Independent work	399-400; cf. p. 459
Three-way discussion	Application; Communication	For	Small group discussion	Peer	Collaboration; initiative	399-400; 394-395
Team selection exercise	Thinking; Application	For	Group task, applying Rawls' veil of ignorance	Peer; teacher	Collaboration	402-403
Four- corners debate	Thinking; Communication	As	Responding to Sandel's lecture 8 (see Teaching Strategy 2)	Peer; teacher	Initiative; self-regula- tion	402-403

# **Prior Learning Needed**

It may be helpful for students to look at a variety of examples of communism in different societies, before learning about the idea of advanced communism. Show a documentary on peoples such as the Baka, who reside in the southeastern rain forests of Cameroon, Republic of Congo, Gabon, and Central African Republic, as well as the Yanomami in the Amazon rain forest in Brazil and Venezuela. (There are some older NOVA documentaries on both peoples mentioned.) Reciprocity or exchange, as well as an egalitarian lifestyle are of central importance to these peoples. In these communities, the shaman has more discretionary power, as do elders over children, but the societies are much less hierarchical than our own, and closer to what anarchists and communists advocate for modernized, industrialized society. For additional background on the Baka people, follow this link:

> http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2Kuf1TgaCgk&feature=results\_video&playnext= 1&list=PL079C6E4AF4408DCB

For additional background on the Yanomami people, look up the following video titles on YouTube:

First Contact - Lost Tribe of The Amazon - Sunday Night - Channel Seven

Yanomamo: Forest People ("Song of the Forest")

Amazonian Tribe Yanomamo Shaman Chief Shoefoot Testimony (1 of 2)

The history of colonialism is also important background for students to have going into this section of the chapter.

## **Teaching/Learning Strategies**

1. The discussion of equal distribution of wealth takes us first into Marxist theory (SE pp. 399-400). One aspect of historical and dialectical materialism (i.e., Marxist theory) is that the substratum or economic base (e.g., relations of employment) of a society drives changes in the superstructure or culture of a society. This aspect of Marx's philosophy comes from Hegel's discussion of the master-slave relationship in Phenomenology of Spirit; see SE p. 459 in Chapter 18 for the connection to the "awakening of critical consciousness," essential for fomenting struggles of liberation.

Acc Some students may be disposed negatively toward Marxist theory, perhaps because their parents fled from an Eastern European country or China, where the regimes ran dictatorships under the banner of socialism or communism. Ask students to distinguish between the philosophy and its poor implementation in some states. As well, encourage understanding of the historical circumstances that contributed to the failure of these large-scale social experiments. Other students might be enticed to treat communism more seriously if you discuss "liberation theology," where thinkers (often in Latin America or Africa) brought together left-leaning politics and a Christian view that the "meek shall inherit the Earth." Look up these links for primary documents relating to communism:

http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1848/communist-manifesto/http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/61

Marx's early writings were more existentialist, addressing themes of alienation or estrangement from our labour (see Figure 16-14, SE p. 401: children working in factories is still a reality in many countries today). Look up the following link to read Marx's paper "Estranged Labour":

http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1844/manuscripts/labour.htm

You may also want to look up these video clips on YouTube. The speakers in these videos hold strong points of view. Some caution may be warranted if you show these videos to students, in terms of filtering or contextualizing the speakers' biases for students:

5. Lecture on Karl Marx (1818-1883)

Slavoj Žižek - Capitalism

Chomsky on Socialism

Michael Moore Talks About Socialism

One way of approaching this topic of equal distribution of wealth is to have three students form a group. Ask them to carry out a conversation on how goods should be distributed in society. Assign each student one philosophy to represent—Marxism, liberalism, or conservatism. Then ask students to drop their masks and speak for themselves, giving their own point of view.

Students can also help each other by illustrating the stages of history proposed by Marx in historical and dialectical materialism, giving a mechanism for the driving forces behind revolutions. For an example, see this link:

http://pauldoestheweb.com/essay/essays/marx.html

These are the six stages through time of historical and dialectical materialism. Stage six is "the end of history."

- 1. Primitive communism (egalitarian society)
- 2. Classical slave-based society
- 3. Feudal serfdom, caste-based society
- 4. Capitalist, wage-based society
- 5. Socialist, classless society
- 6. Advanced communist, modernized egalitarian society

According to Marx, communism is the final stage of historical development, achieving equality while meeting the needs of all. Like many religions, it envisions an eschatological leap to a new, heavenly state of being, akin to Augustine's *City of God* or More's *Utopia*. In practice, as opposed to theory, experiments in socialism have often resulted in dictatorships, not of the working class (the proletariat) but

of the supreme leader. The cult of the individual, megalomaniac leader (e.g., Stalin, Mao, Castro) was not part of Marx's theory.

The mechanism of change is dialectical in that frustration among the impoverished classes leads to incremental, quantitative changes in society, and finally boils over in a qualitative "phase change" through revolution. It is like water slowly coming to a boil and finally turning to steam. For the dialectical process of critical awakening among the workers, also see SE p. 459.

2. John Rawls was a highly influential liberal theorist in the United States and abroad. Encourage students to read Rawls' ideas on justice on SE pp. 401-403 and in Chapter 17, SE pp. 428-229.

Activity: A good way to introduce the main concept behind Rawls' idea of the *veil* of ignorance is to ask students how they would most fairly pick soccer or volleyball teams. How could they pick teams to avoid a situation where the convener for a tournament (who makes up the teams and the roster of play) stacks the teams and schedule in his or her own favour (i.e., giving him or herself the best players and easiest schedule).

See also Michael Sandel's Harvard lecture on Rawls, which is both entertaining and informative. Use this lecture to generate a four-corners debate on whether students agree or disagree with Rawls, are undecided or unclear about his ideas, or want to use some of his ideas but also have some specific reservations about doing so. Go to the following link and click on Episode 08 to see the lecture:

http://www.justiceharvard.org/2011/02/episode-08/watch

Acc Follow these links for discussion guides to assist enriched or challenged students:

Advanced discussion guide

http://www.justiceharvard.org/resources/episode-8-discussion-guide-advanced/

Beginner discussion guide

http://www.justiceharvard.org/resources/episode-8-discussion-guide-beginner/

Visit Google Books to see a preview of John Rawls' *A Theory of Justice*. This primary text reading is useful for students here and again in Chapter 17.

Acc Visit the following links for interpretation guides that may prove helpful for some students:

http://www.wku.edu/~jan.garrett/ethics/johnrawl.htm

http://www.ohio.edu/people/piccard/entropy/rawls.html

And this link provides a brief explanation of Rawls' ideas in cartoon form:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hCJqNrqWykU

**3.** Equal treatment, colonialism, liberation through violence and non-violence (SE pp. 403-407): The margin quote from Gandhi on SE p. 405 provides an entry point into his philosophy of non-violent resistance: a determined and yet peaceful way of addressing inequality and racism.

Acc Consider asking students to create a word wall to post definitions of terms from Gandhi's philosophy (see SE p. 405). Look up the following video titles on YouTube:

Mahatma Gandhi Talks- First Indian Talking Movie

Mahatma Gandhi Speech

Gandhi's non-violence speech

"Viewpoints" feature about Fanon's and Mandela's approaches to liberation (SE pp. 406-407): Use this feature to help prompt students to write journal entries (see BLM J). Use students' answers to questions 1 and 2, SE p. 407, for assessment *of* learning.

Ask students: "Which of the philosophers discussed so far in this chapter section help to 'reciprocally illuminate' (to borrow a phrase from James Tully) each other?" Ask: "Can you 'read one [philosopher] through the other,' enhancing rather than obscuring the philosophy of the other?" Ask students to animate thinkers and their ideas using puppets or cartoons. Silly as it may seem, this process can facilitate dialogue among students, exploring the differences in philosophers' ideas, as well as creating some levity in these heavy topics.

For further background, look up the following video titles on YouTube:

Frantz Fanon Documentary - Black Skin, White Mask - 1/5

ESPY Awards - Nelson Mandela

Nelson Mandela, The Freedom Struggle

Nelson Mandela - Speech (46664 Cape Town)

Malcolm X, of course, did not advocate non-violent resistance. Look up this video title on YouTube:

Malcolm X Speech: 'Stop Singing, Start Swinging!'

**4.** Mary Wollstonecraft appears on SE p. 408 in reference to women's rights. Ask students to read from her work *A Vindication of the Rights of Woman* by following these links:

http://www.bartleby.com/144/

http://etext.virginia.edu/toc/modeng/public/WolVind.html

For a secondary source interpretation of Wollstonecraft's work, follow this link:

http://records.viu.ca/~johnstoi/introser/wollst.htm

Consider using section question 4 on SE p. 408 as the basis for student journal responses (see BLM J).

- Ask students to gather several key Wollstonecraft quotes to share with the class, gathering notable sayings they can decoratively post in the classroom or put on T-shirts they design. Students may also want to give a dramatic reading of Wollstonecraft's writings.
- **5.** Responsibilities (SE pp. 409-410): Discuss with the class the obligations citizens should have in society. Ask students to consider which responsibilities they will include in their ideal society for the culminating activity, Utopia Project. For example, would students include mandatory military service? Taxes? Mandatory voting? Should people have the responsibility to try to have children after a war to repopulate the country? Should people be obliged to develop their latent abilities, to put them to use for society? For example, if someone could be an Olympic gold medalist, do they have an obligation to compete for their country?

Returning to Plato, Aristotle, and Aquinas, we encounter the notion that cultivation of reason and virtue is an obligation of citizens. Is attending school a duty? Is conserving traditions of the past a duty (SE p. 410) or is that outdated? Should newly arrived immigrants celebrate the traditions of the host or dominant culture (e.g., celebrate Canada Day on July 1st, or give out Halloween candy)? Use section questions 1-4 on SE p. 411 to stimulate class discussion.

**6.** Use BLM 16.3 Chapter 16 Vocabulary Quiz: Matching for assessment of students' learning. (You may wish to create a second version of the matching vocabulary quiz to help prevent students from copying one another—that is, students seated beside one another would be given a different version of the quiz. Do this by using the same.)

Acc Consider offering a written version of this quiz for students who do not succeed using the matching format in BLM 16.3. Sometimes, the grammar of matching-format quizzes gets in the way of student achievement. These students may do better writing down what they know about the key concepts. Spelling does not have to count, as it does not count for the matching-format vocabulary quiz.

#### **Text Answers**

## Page 403: Thought Experiment

- 1. Ways in which our society could benefit from operating under a "veil of ignorance" could include the following: marking student papers without knowing who it is, thus lending more neutrality; having conveners of teams (e.g., soccer) pick the fairest teams, with a balance or assortment of players on each, not knowing which team they will get to coach; issuing goods based on need, not knowing where the need exists to prevent bias in selection (e.g., scholarships to university based on merit and need).
- 2. Rawls' concept of the "original position" works from the liberal assumption that all people have the right to be treated equally, unless they have done something that warrants punishment. Distributive justice is about ensuring equality of rights and goods in society, but retributive justice allows for some people to be imprisoned and denied their liberty to repay crimes against society. The liberal virtue of tolerance suggests that people should not be denied rights or goods for reasons of race, religion, age, orientation, gender, etc.

# Page 407: Viewpoints

- 1. Colonialism represents a denial of equal rights, or inherent inequities, in its economic, political, and social forms of organization. Trade balances, power, and cultural capital all resided in the Old European, largely white and Christian core. Fanon's philosophical beliefs, based on the revolutionary spirit of Karl Marx, led him to oppose colonialism in his writings and advocate for social change, even if it meant violent struggle for emancipation. Whether students agree may depend on their philosophical and/or religious beliefs.
- 2. Whereas Fanon can justify armed resistance to usher in a new society, according to Marxist views of how history progresses through revolutions (American, French, Russian, etc.), Mandela (in his post-prison phase) followed in the non-violent path of resistance established by Gandhi.

### Page 408: Section questions

- **1.** Mills once pointed out that the concept of 'race' does not appear in Rawls' book *A Theory of Justice*. It was an eye opener for some liberals to think that they could be overlooking such an obvious aspect of inequality in most societies, and clearly in North America where Rawls wrote and taught.
- **2.** Principles of humility, turning the other cheek instead of hitting back, and self-sacrifice (aspects of *satyagraha*) can be found not only in Hindu religion, but in Christianity, Judaism, Islam, and Buddhism, among other world religions.

- **3.** German philosopher Leibniz once approached the King of France with the proposal to unite all of Christendom, divided by sectarian warfare, by waging war on Egypt, the so-called infidel. Perhaps the question should be, if religion has the power to unite people, for what purpose are they united? The ancient idea of ecumenicalism speaks of unifying the world into one entity, but it has always been suspect as a mission to assimilate.
- **4.** a) Wollstonecraft's philosophy was inspired by Rousseau's, but she took issue with his blatant sexism. Whereas he argued that women were by nature intended to secure the home base for the benefit of the family and to alleviate the men, she argued that women were socialized into domestic roles by outdated practices. She pointed out that soldiers wear funny costumes (feathered hats, red coats with shiny brass buttons, etc.) and parade around in strange ways because of their socialization, not by nature. Likewise, girls can break into a run without jeopardizing their health, she argued, if only you let them.
  - b) Her ideas about the education of women share with Rousseau an appreciation of applied learning, as opposed to scholasticism or rote learning. In his famous work *Emile* (so popular it was rented out by the hour), Rousseau devoted his attention to (hypothetically) educating boys; he left only the last chapter to address the education of Sophie, Emile's intended mate and virtual nanny-wife. Wollstonecraft, on the other hand, actually created her model school for girls, intending to redress the problems of inequality by offering opportunities to young women.

#### Page 411: Section questions

- **1.** Duties or responsibilities of citizens might include:
  - · paying taxes
  - military service
  - · obeying the law
  - voting (not a universal duty, but considered an obligation in democracies)
  - allegiance of fealty (not spying for foreign governments; no treachery)

What common ground or general agreement reveals about a group is another question. Neo-pragmatist Richard Rorty would say general agreement is a sign of solidarity (SE pp. 287-288) rather than some underlying universal principle of reason (as Kantians and utilitarians would be inclined to think).

- **2.** Raising the question of temporal or cultural contingency in the list of citizens' responsibilities above (question 1) is another way of getting at the matter of *nominalism versus realism* (see SE p. 285).
- 3. Perhaps an anecdote will help. In the 1980s, an abandoned military base on an island in Copenhagen was taken over by squatters, who occupied the buildings and formed an independent community named Christiania. Without any police, the relatively peaceful marijuana trade was supplanted with heroin dealers and gangs, quickly spinning out of control. Women were afraid to walk the streets at night, so the community formed its own vigilante law enforcers to drive out the hard drugs and the problems they bring. After an experiment in anarchism, people cried out for a social contract of some kind.

Of course, many people in our society have stopped using their car's turn signals when making a turn; other drivers even drive through stop streets without stopping, now that they are preoccupied with cellphones. What level of anarchy is tolerable? Jaywalking is illegal, but people do it in Canada; it is not common in Japan, where the culture is more conservative.

Here is an example of the type of table students are asked to prepare.

Living in a state without laws	Advantages	Disadvantages
personal freedoms		
protections		
basic rights for all		
duties		
education		
resources at disposal		
conditions for equality		

**4.** It is expected that sometime in the next 50 years we will suffer a pandemic that will kill over 300 million people, similar to the Spanish flu of 1918 that killed over 50 million (before the era of trans-Atlantic flights). Making inoculation a civic duty could be considered, but then what is the punishment for not complying? Would imprisonment really work to deter people from breaking this law, or solve the problem of the pandemic? Is forcible inoculation an option, given that some people may have religious objections to modern medical practices (e.g., Christian Scientists)?

# Pages 412-413: Chapter Review

**1.** Here is an example of the organizer students are asked to produce. Students' ideas about the strengths and weaknesses of philosophers' ideas will vary greatly.

Key Philosophers	Concepts	Strengths	Weaknesses
Plato	Philosopher-king		
Aristotle	Polis, logos, praxis		
al-Farabi	Virtuous city		
Ibn Sina (Avicenna)	Just city		
Aquinas	Natural law; common good		
More	Utopia		
Machiavelli	Virtu, fortune		
Locke	Social contract		
Hobbes	Leviathan (monster) of a state; social contract		
Rousseau	Social contract–General will; state of nature		
Burke	Conservatism		
Proudhon	Anarchism		

2. Under capitalism, the private entrepreneurs or risk-takers make the economic decisions; under a command economy, as with socialism, the state decides how much and where to produce. The principle behind capitalism is that competition should root out inefficiencies and lead to lower prices and better goods for those who can

- earn enough to afford them; under a command economy, it is control of production that is meant to ensure quality and equality of distribution for those contributing to or dependent upon society—"From each according to his ability, to each according to his need."
- **3.** Ideologies press a certain mindset or doctrine, and rigidly occupy a place on the political spectrum, tending to sway people by means of emotion and coercion. Fascism is an ideology, and although there are anarchist philosophers, many who identify as anarchists also adhere to an ideology: unification under the banner of opposition to authority. Philosophy, on the other hand, advocates critical inquiry instead of adherence to doctrines or manifestos. There are both capitalist and Marxist philosophers, however, so one must be careful not to assume that all who occupy these positions are ideologues. Rational inquiry and open deliberation apply as well to Adam Smith and Karl Marx or Friedrich Engels.
- **4.** Here is an example of a question that is relevant to political philosophy and addresses the concerns of gender equality and race in Canada. The following old adage was and idea that was actually drawn upon by women's groups at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries: If Canadian women are by nature the gentler sex, less corrupt and therefore to be protected from the evils of politics, then why don't they run the education and health-care systems, employing that goodness for the benefit of all?
- **5.** This sample answer matches the thinkers in the right column correctly to the questions and ideas in the left column. When students make up their own questions, they should scramble the order of the thinkers to test their peers' knowledge.

Question/Idea	Thinker
<b>a.</b> How can goods be distributed equitably in society? (veil of ignorance)	<b>a.</b> Rawls
<b>b.</b> Through history, what is the driving force behind social change? (class struggle)	<b>b.</b> Marx
<b>c.</b> Why do people enter into constitutions and willingly give up some of their freedom? (social contract)	<b>c.</b> Hobbes, Locke, Rousseau
<b>d.</b> What are the advantages of preserving traditions? (conservatism)	<b>d.</b> Burke
<b>e.</b> How do subjects cultivate their capacities, interests, or traits within society? ( <i>virtu</i> )	<b>e.</b> Machiavelli
<b>f.</b> How can governance be shifted from greed and self interest to mutual interest? (utopia)	<b>f.</b> More
<b>g.</b> Who is best fit to rule wisely? (philosopher-king)	<b>g.</b> Plato
<b>h.</b> Who was concerned with understanding which systems of government (monarchy, aristocracy, democracy) best serve the common good of different societies?	<b>h.</b> Aristotle
i. When is violence warranted in achieving social change? (post- or anti-colonialism)	i. Fanon
<b>j.</b> When is civil disobedience the better option for leveraging change? (passive resistance)	<b>j.</b> Gandhi

- **6.** Try forming the values line dividing those who believe in strict laws and those who would prefer few, if any, laws. After the class has lined up, discuss the problem of abolishing laws (e.g., in the Wild West or blood-diamond mines today in Africa). It may be that in your class there are not enough anarchists to carry out this debate, in which case you can fine tune the motion to something your students can discuss. It will likely be difficult to get students to occupy the side of the debate that would abolish any punishment for breaking any law (stealing, rape, murder, etc.), as it is so one-sided. It might work better to debate the following resolution: Be it resolved that our society will set fixed (inflexible) punishments for breaking laws. This is currently being debated in Canada (2011, 2012), as the Conservative government has called for mandatory sentences to avoid a situation where judges lessen penalties out of compassion. School administrators also face this request from teachers, but, like judges, want to base the outcome on thorough consideration of circumstances.
- 7. Students may not feel attached enough to anarchism, communism, monarchy, or theocracy, and even less so to fascism and totalitarianism, to defend these philosophies with their lives. Democracy, however, does evoke patriotic devotion, and students can be motivated to consider whether they would sacrifice their lives to preserve it. Tibetan monks are self-immolating to protest against Chinese totalitarianism.

In his essay "Perpetual Peace," Kant argued that we should avoid a world government as there is the risk of it being a global tyranny, overriding the wills of various peoples. This outcome is feasible, as we have seen it before with various imperialist attempts to dominate the world. The structure and mandate of world government might therefore have to preserve the autonomy or sovereignty of governments, much like provinces or states within a confederation. This is republicanism, in the organizational sense.

- **8.** Gandhi's philosophy of *satyagraha* can be applied to any struggle for liberation, at any scale: nations to school clubs (e.g., gay-straight alliances).
- 9. Burke was a conservative, accepting gradual or incremental change instead of social upheaval. Marxists believe that revolution is natural, social change occurring like phase changes (liquids boiling into steam). Where Marxists also get conservative is with the final stage of history: advanced communism. It is hard to imagine the people overthrowing such an ideal state, but as we saw these states in their fallible existence—despotic regimes like the USSR—it is easy to imagine an uprising. The revolutions of 2011 in the Middle East and North Africa are fine examples
- **10.** The role-play activity could be made fun if the class likes acting, but it may be hard to think in character, coming up with philosophical questions for colonial powers and the revolutionaries that fought against them. Connecting the debate to the Rebellions of 1837 in Ontario, with William Lyon Mackenzie King versus the Family Compact, would tie into Canadian history.
- **11.** In writing the pro-feminist speech for an audience in the late 1700s, consider using some of the key terms on SE p. 388. In the speech, students might ask men to consider: Who was left out of your social contract?